THE CITY OF CARDIFF COUNCIL CYNGOR DINAS CAERDYDD

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

10th MARCH 2015

RECYCLING WASTE STRATEGY & RESIDUAL WASTE RESTRICTING PROGRAMME 2015

Purpose of Report

 To provide Members with a summary of the Recycling Waste Strategy and Residual Waste Restricting Programme that is due to be considered at Cabinet on the 2nd April 2015. A report titled 'Recycling Waste Strategy and Residual Waste Restricting Programme' will highlight the changes required in 2015; comment on the business planning for 2016-18; look at the regional recycling infrastructure required and the Council's position on meeting targets and the Waste (England and Wales) (Amendment) regulations 2012 for kerbside dry recycling.

Background

- 2. The Cabinet report will be supported by the Draft Recycling Waste Management Strategy 2015. It will set out the required household recycling and waste collection changes for 2015 (Implementation Phase 1), updates to the service provision for the household waste recycling centres, reuse of unwanted goods (Implementation Phase 2) and identify any further steps necessary to deliver longer term statutory targets such as amendments to kerbside recycling (Implementation Phase 3). The immediate service changes in the Draft Recycling Waste Management Strategy 2015 'Implementation Phase 1 Residual Waste Restriction Programme' are required to support achievement of the statutory recycling target of 58% by the end of March 2016. They will also help address the savings which were approved in the 2015/16 budget setting process.
- 3. In addition the recycling programme and governance arrangements that are proposed to ensure Cardiff meets its obligations under the Waste (England and Wales) (Amendment) regulations 2012 and the subsequent statutory guidance on the separate collection of

waste paper, metal, plastic and glass will be provided. The Recycling & Waste Restricting Programme would also support the partnership with Welsh Government to explore the feasibility study for regional recycling infrastructure in Wales.

- 4. The Council has to comply with the following waste legalisation in relation to waste performance and recycling:
 - Waste (England and Wales) (Amendment) regulations 2012;
 - The Landfill Allowances Scheme (Wales) Regulations 2004 for the disposal of biodegradable waste;
 - Waste (Wales) Measure 2010;
 - Recycling, Preparation for Re-use and Composting Targets (Definitions) (Wales) Order 2011 and Regulations 4 and 5 of The Recycling, Preparation for Re-use and Composting Targets (Monitoring and Penalties) (Wales) Regulations 2011 for recycling performance targets.

Issues

- 5. Cardiff's existing Waste Management Strategy 2011-2015 was published in 2011 and resulted in a significant change to the way recycling and waste is collected in the city. It moved the city to a fortnightly collection of residual waste and separate weekly collections for food waste and recycling. This change in kerbside collection method, along with adopting many other recommendations from the previous waste strategy has seen Cardiff's overall recycling, re-use and composting rate rise from 39% in 2009/10 to 52% in 2012/13. The City of Cardiff Council achieved its first statutory reuse/recycling & composting target of 52% in 2012/13. However, the 2013/14 period saw the city only achieving 50%.
- 6. The following statutory targets are in place and each carries a £200 per tonne penalty for failure. As a result of Cardiff's recycling performance in 2013/14 the Council could face fines in excess of £800,000. Therefore, it is imperative that the Council takes steps to improve its recycling performance.

Cardiff's Statutory Targets

• Table 1 - Targets on waste collected by Local Authorities

Targets on waste collected by Local Authorities	2014/15	2015/16	2019/20	2024/25
Minimum overall recycling	52%	58%	64%	70%
Maximum level of landfill	-	-	10%	5%
Maximum level of energy from waste	-	42%	36%	30%
Cardiff's Biodegradable Landfill Allowance	43729t	41692t	33557t	-

- Table 1 illustrates the waste targets that have been allocated to Welsh Local Authorities. It should be noted that the 2014/15 target for minimum overall recycling is 52%; this will increase to 58% in 2015/16, 64% in 2019/20 and 70% by 2024/25.
- 8. In addition to statutory targets, there has been a change to the fundamental EU legislation that relates to recycling and waste collections. This is set out in the revised Waste Framework Directive 2012 and subsequently the Waste (England and Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2012. These regulations outline the need for separate collections of waste paper, metal, plastic or glass by January 2015 or a robust evidence based defence to demonstrate that the current collection methods used can achieve high quality recycling, whilst also being the best Technical, Environmental and Economically Practicable solution (TEEP).
- 9. Absolute change was not required by 1st January 2015, however, the Council has to develop a business case for any proposed changes or create a TEEP evidence base. Any business case must be benchmarked against a kerbside sort box solution as the EU and Welsh Government determine this method to be to the optimum solution for low cost, sustainable and high quality recycling services.
- 10. The majority of the initiatives identified in the old strategy 2011-2015 to take the Council to 52% have been delivered. The revised strategy is required to deliver the next step changes in recycling performance and take the council to over 64% by 2020. This in effect means that after taking into consideration waste and population growth we have to

recycle approximately an additional 32,000 tonnes of waste in Cardiff each year; the current recycling volume is currently 85,578 tonnes per annum. In 2013/14 the Council failed to reach the recycling targets by over 4000 tonnes. The "do nothing option" is not an option for Cardiff; if no further changes are made to the council recycling waste collection service delivery, the fines between now and 2020 could equate to over £21m.

- 11. Therefore, as a comingled authority, the Council is developing a robust evidence base around its decision process and present data modelling on the Councils current chosen collection methods. The main areas that the Council needs to consider in this evidence base are:
 - High Quality Recycling How do the councils current end markets compare with that of kerbside recycling systems, for example, do we supply the same closed loop markets. There is a potential legal argument that as long as the material is recycled then this meets the definition of high quality recycling. Welsh Government has taken this meaning to be closed loop only as kerbside sort is perceived to provide higher quality outputs;
 - **Technically Practicable** Is there any reason why kerbside sort cannot be undertaken. This can be taken down to a very small localised area, for example, flats;
 - Environmentally Practicable Is it more damaging to the environment to undertake kerbside sort than the current method, for example, an increased carbon footprint;
 - Economically Practicable The service costs from collections through to reprocessing should be compared against the default kerbside collection and reprocessing systems.
- 12. The Council should also consider:
 - Human Health This could be the impacts of increased traffic congestion from slower kerbside collections and/or having to transport product to further distances to ensure they are processed through a closed loop processors;
 - **Social Impacts** This could cover a wide number of impacts and include the number of people employed in the street scene and quality impact on residents.

- A report titled 'Draft Outline Waste Strategy 2015 2018' was considered at scrutiny in October 2014 before being approved by Cabinet later in the same month. The item provided Members with a summary of the Outline Waste Management Strategy for 2015 to 2018.
- Copies of the papers for the item and the letter sent from the Chair of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee to the Cabinet Member for the Environment following scrutiny on the 7th October 2014 have been attached as Appendices 1 & 2.
- 15. The October 2014 Cabinet report titled 'Outline Waste Strategy 2015 2018' summarised the work undertaken to explore the various restricting collection models for Cardiff. These included alternatives such as three and four weekly residual waste collections; sustainability impacts of those models and the cost impacts on service delivery including the effect on the Materials Recycling Facility and the market income achievable. The report also approved the commencement of the stakeholder consultation which took place alongside the wider Council budget consultation (November 21st 2014 to January 12th 2015).
- 16. Since October 2014 the draft 'Outline Recycling Waste Strategy 2015 18' has been further developed to reflect the outcome of the public consultation exercise. In doing this the Council has been working with the Welsh Government's Collaborate Change Programme which was established to support authorities to ensure legislative compliance and have plans in place to achieve the Statutory Recycling Target of 70% by 2024/25.
- 17. The Council now needs to take preventative measures to ensure future recycling targets are secured and cost efficiencies maximised. In addition we must test our compliance with the duties to collect recyclate separately and obtain high quality recycling the outcome of which will be the subject of future reports. This report mainly considers the Implementation Phase 1 Residual Waste Restriction Programme and the steps that the Council is taking to:
 - Meet the recycling targets and saving requirements for 2015/16 through restricting general waste and delivering the approved Household recycling centre changes;
 - Outline the future position on the recycling collections methodology;

- Seek cost reductions and deliver the most cost effective recycling approach for Cardiff;
- Maintain existing and secure future high quality recycling markets;
- Reduce our Carbon footprint;
- Secure long term regional working and partnerships for recycling.
- 18. In parallel to the Councils 2015/16 budget stakeholder events and consultation, a separate consultation was run to consider recycling and waste services. The consultation was shared with a number of key stakeholders including residents, community groups, front line staff, Councillors, contractors, and a random postal survey of 3000 residents. A total number of 1443 responses were received. The results will be discussed at the meeting.

Household Waste Collection Changes for Restriction in 2015

- 19. Since the publication of the 2011 Waste Strategy the need for further restricting residual waste has been highlighted. Analysis of the residual waste clearly shows that a high proportion of recycling and food waste remains in the waste stream. If the Council is to achieve 58% recycling in 2015/16 and change people's habits towards waste minimisation and recycling, a consistent restricting programme is required city wide.
- 20. The Welsh Government's preferred collection blue print sets out the introduction of 140 litre bins as best practice. As the recycling targets increase to 58% next year, more Local Authorities are changing to smaller wheeled bins or reducing the frequency to three weekly, some are considering four weekly collections.
- 21. Any change in service provision which might occur would create a period of disruption whilst the operatives and residents become familiar with the changes. It is anticipated that any period of disruption would be resolved within 3 months. In the event of any change additional resources would be provided to Connect 2 Cardiff as well as Waste Management to support the transition. Following any potential change extra Waste Officers would be put in place to provide education on recycling support and enforcement.
- 22. A strong communication plan would be proposed to support any potential change as all communities would need to be made aware of alterations to the waste collection system. Existing Equality Impact Assessments' would be completed and the consultation

feedback would need to be built into any proposals. A statutory screening tool would need to be completed to ensure that the changes support all residents.

Recycling Infrastructure Project

- 23. The benefits to Cardiff through regional working and joint procurements have been well evidenced with the success of projects such as the Project Gwyrdd Residual Waste Treatment Contract and the Cardiff Organic Waste Treatment Contract. In addition to these Cardiff participates in and manages a number of regional procurement contracts, for example, electrical items, wood, textiles and street cleansing sweepings. By combining together we share the resource costs and secure better gates fees through economies of scale. The Welsh Government is keen to support more regional working to secure longer term cost savings.
- 24. Regional approaches have been tried and tested for residual waste, food and green waste facilities across Wales; however, there remains a gap in the market for recyclable materials. All local authorities' process to varying degrees the same type of materials, for example, paper, card, plastics, glass and metals from the kerbside. They also collect a large volume of other materials, for example, furniture, wood, rubble, oils, batteries, textiles and other bulkier items from household waste collections.
- 25. Regardless of the collection method for dry recycling it is clear that the best market prices and quality can be obtained by further sorting materials ready for market, for example, glass into different colours; plastics into different types; metals into steel and aluminium and also depending on market condition paper into different grades. There are a few local, small scale facilities across Wales, including our own Materials Recycling Facility, but no large scale facilities exist in Wales and much of Wales' recyclate is processed across the UK.
- 26. It is proposed, through partnership with Welsh Government and support from Local Partnerships (funded by Welsh Government) that Cardiff will explore the feasibly of a regional recycling facility. The programme will initially seek expressions of interest from surrounding and regional local authorities; test the market appetite for such a facility and most importantly establish the materials required to match any facility requirements. The initial scope of materials under consideration will remain wide in order to maximise the potential of any such venture. The main objectives of the facility will initially be:

- To secure future recycling capacity for the region;
- To deliver high quality materials to the market place;
- To provide a flexible processing facility for all dry recycling materials;
- To provide economies of scale to deliver cost effective processing and maximise income potential for the region.
- 27. Cardiff recognises the importance of delivering cost effective recycling solutions that yield high quality materials, based on robust evidence. Therefore over the next year, in partnership with Welsh Government and support from Local Partnership (funded by Welsh Government) the following work will be undertaken:
 - Assessment of necessity to change following evidence from the data collection from Material Recycling Facility (MRF) regulations; from data collection to the restricting project and further processing and market income potential.
 - Finalising the cost of options for collections, and detailed long term financial profile to proceed to full business case.
 - Timeline for change, considering vehicle changes and existing infrastructure requirements and lifespans.
- 28. A programme board would be established, chaired by Cardiff's Chief Executive that will consist of Cardiff Officers and Welsh Government with support from Local Partnerships. The programme will oversee the development of options and proposals for the future Implementation Phases recycling collection method which will be presented in 2016 once the detailed analysis has been completed.

Issues

29. Councillor Bob Derbyshire, Cabinet Member for the Environment and officers from the Environment Directorate have been invited to attend to give a presentation and to answer Members' questions on the 'Recycling Waste Strategy & Residual Waste Restricting Programme 2015'.

Way Forward

30. The meeting will provide the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the 'Recycling Waste Strategy & Residual Waste Restricting Programme 2015'. Any comments and observations made should be sent to the Cabinet Member for the Environment for his consideration.

Legal Implications

31. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct legal implications. However, legal implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any legal implications arising from those recommendations. All decisions taken by or on behalf of the Council must (a) be within the legal powers of the Council; (b) comply with any procedural requirement imposed by law; (c) be within the powers of the body or person exercising powers on behalf of the Council; (d) be undertaken in accordance with the procedural requirements imposed by the Council e.g. Scrutiny Procedure Rules; (e) be fully and properly informed; (f) be properly motivated; (g) be taken having regard to the Council's fiduciary duty to its taxpayers; and (h) be reasonable and proper in all the circumstances.

Financial Implications

32. The Scrutiny Committee is empowered to enquire, consider, review and recommend but not to make policy decisions. As the recommendations in this report are to consider and review matters there are no direct financial implications at this stage in relation to any of the work programme. However, financial implications may arise if and when the matters under review are implemented with or without any modifications. Any report with recommendations for decision that goes to Cabinet/Council will set out any financial implications arising from those recommendations.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The Committee is recommended to:

- Consider the information in the report, appendices and provided at the meeting;
- Decide whether they would like to make any comments to the Cabinet;
- Decide the way forward for any future scrutiny of the issues discussed.

MARIE ROSENTHAL County Clerk and Monitoring Officer 6th March 2015